

REVIEW TEAM BACKGROUND ANALYSIS AND SCOPE OF WORK

REVIEW

MISSION STATEMENTS

The mission of the Economic Development area is to ensure that all segments of Winston-Salem's economy remain healthy and growing by providing a positive growth atmosphere and effective assistance to businesses that locate, expand or start operations in Winston-Salem.

The mission of the Minority and Women Business Enterprise Program is to provide minority and women owned and operated businesses equal opportunity to participate in all aspects of City contracting and purchasing programs.

The mission of the Enterprise Community/Business Development office is to create and retain jobs and augment the tax base of Winston-Salem, providing additional attention to the area generally bounded by Waughtown Street on the south; the Smith-Reynolds Airport area on the north; US 52 on the west and Brushy Fork Creek on the east, through a series of inter-related programs and activities assisting business start-ups and expansions.

INTERNAL GOAL SETTING: ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT

PROGRAM GOALS: ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT PROJECTS

- To structure projects so that the City's investment is returned through new property tax revenues in no more than seven years
- To operate programs that result in the creation of new permanent jobs and increased tax base in Winston-Salem, while not negatively impacting the quality of life

FY 1998-1999 OBJECTIVES

- Complete Phase I of Union Cross Business Park road and utility improvements
- Provide timely assistance to WSBI, Chamber of Commerce and individual companies in structuring incentive packages for new and expanding companies
- Implement programs to further diversify the local economy by moving towards a technology based economy

PROGRAM GOALS: LOAN PROGRAM

- To make loans that result in projects that create new permanent jobs, increased tax base and investment in certain geographic target areas. The primary target areas are Downtown and the Enterprise Community (East Winston)
- Ensure that existing loan portfolio is managed properly so that loan repayments are received in a timely fashion

FY 1998-1999 OBJECTIVES

- Monitor existing loans to ensure that all loan payments are kept current - take action as appropriate
- Respond in a timely fashion to requests from businesses/developers for assistance with economic development projects

PROGRAM GOALS: DOWNTOWN DEVELOPMENT

- To facilitate economic development in the downtown area as a part of the overall Economic Development Program of the City of Winston-Salem, through the acquisition and sale of real property, building renovations, facade loans, street scape improvements, and the implementation of the Piedmont Triad Research Park Master Plan

FY 1998-1999 OBJECTIVES

- Board of Aldermen adoption of New Century Plan for the Downtown Area
- Development of work program for New Century Plan implementation
- Board of Aldermen adoption of New Century Plan Implementation Budget
- Execution of contract for Urban Entertainment Center feasibility study/business plan
- Determine feasibility of Major League Soccer team and stadium
- Transfer of Research Park assets and responsibilities to North Carolina Emerging Technology Alliance
- Identify new sources of revenue for the Downtown Development Corporation
- Acquire control of sites for Class A office space and for urban entertainment center

INTERNAL GOAL SETTING: M/WBE

PROGRAM GOALS: IDENTIFICATION AND CERTIFICATION

- To identify and recruit minority and women owned businesses
- To assist minority and woman owned businesses to develop relationships with majority companies
- To network with other M/WBE offices and small business resource offices to stay abreast of current industry trends and information

FY 1998-1999 OBJECTIVES

- Implement the new M/WBE Certification Program (Year 2000 compliant)

PROGRAM GOALS: EDUCATION/TRAINING ACTIVITIES

- Continue publishing the M/WBE newsletter, to include training seminars, projects, bidding opportunities, continuing education courses, business development council conferences and business opportunity fairs
- To develop and carry out networking sessions with various City Departments and appropriate M/WBE firms
- To develop and carry out other training programs that are identified as needed to address M/WBE deficiencies

FY 1998-1999 OBJECTIVES

- Review M/WBE programs in other cities for best practices

PROGRAM GOALS: ADMINISTRATION

- To provide technical assistance and staff support to the Internal M/WBE Committee and M/WBE Advisory Committee
- To examine contracts and/or other documentation to ensure M/WBE requirements have been met
- To make recommendations to M/WBE Advisory Committee and Board of Aldermen, City/County Utility Commission, Winston-Salem Transit Authority, or Board of Commissioners

PROGRAM GOALS: M/WBE BIDS

- To meet with Purchasing staff to review M/WBE solicitations, bids awarded, dollar amounts of contracts, and problems encountered
- To attend prebid conferences to explain the M/WBE Program and specific project goals and to encourage communication and involvement between M/WBE's and majority contractors
- To assist majority contractors locate certified M/WBE firms
- To monitor the discretionary spending and inform city departments of minority and woman owned firms that can provide the solicited service or product

FY 1998-1999 OBJECTIVES

- To improve discretionary spending within City departments
- To a greater degree monitor purchasing solicitations made by City buyers
- To develop efficiency performance measures for this program

PROGRAM GOALS: SECTION 3 PROGRAM

- Develop subcontractor bid process and implement demonstration on a City funded Housing Authority of Winston-Salem (HAWS) project with later expansion to single family programs
- Identify resources, initiate an ongoing training and self-education process for contractors and subcontractors
- To develop and implement local-sponsored trainee and apprenticeship program in conjunction with CDBG, HOME, COMP grant funds
- To implement a redefined and restructured process that is responsive to needs of individuals within a training context and not dictated by agency or organizational needs

FY 1998-1999 OBJECTIVES

- To develop and implement an advanced Contractors Business Program to include preparation for Commercial General Contracting Licensing, Commercial Blue Print Reading, Case Study and Computer Estimating

INTERNAL GOAL SETTING: ENTERPRISE COMMUNITY/BUSINESS DEVELOPMENT

PROGRAM GOALS: TARGET AREA BUSINESS ASSISTANCE PROGRAM

- To operate a business assistance program that complies with all regulatory requirements
- To provide inducements to encourage businesses to locate within distressed areas of the City in order to create jobs and increase the tax base within these areas of the City
- To provide business and job opportunities, that otherwise would not be available, for low to moderate income individuals and communities

FY 1998-1999 OBJECTIVES

- To identify qualifying areas within the Enterprise Community
- To start offering financial assistance to businesses willing to locate within these qualifying areas

PROGRAM GOALS: BROWNFIELD INITIATIVE

- To bring the public and private sectors together to develop community partnerships and identify significant environmental, economic, and social concerns impacting the economic redevelopment of the Liberty Street area
- To identify critical sites along Liberty Street, according to community need, for future development, and to work together to explore environmental issues and develop remediation plans aimed at meeting these needs
- To revitalize the Liberty Street corridor through the use or reuse of properties (either perceived or actually contaminated) and individuals not meeting their current potential

FY 1998-1999 OBJECTIVES

- Implement EPA Brownfield Demonstration project
- Develop efficiency measures

PROGRAM GOALS: EMPOWERMENT ZONE/DEVELOPMENT ZONE INITIATIVE

- To identify additional sources of funding that would enhance redevelopment efforts within the Enterprise Community, including East Winston
- To develop and submit grants to the appropriate agencies seeking designation as a federal Empowerment Zone and a State Urban Development Zone

FY 1998-1999 OBJECTIVES

- Submit Empowerment Zone grant request to the U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development
- Initiate and submit State Urban Development Zone grant request to the North Carolina Department of Commerce
- Develop additional effectiveness and efficiency measures

PROGRAM GOALS: DEVELOPMENT GUIDE OVERSIGHT

- To monitor and support the implementation of the recommendations of the East Winston Area Plan; Liberty Street Corridor Development Guide; Carver Road/Ogburn Station Development Guide; and the Hammer, Siler, George, and Associates Update
- To create economic development opportunities for East Winston through concentrated marketing efforts

FY 1998-1999 OBJECTIVES

- Complete Lansing Ridge Subdivision
- Develop and implement marketing plan for City land at Old Walkertown/Carver Road
- Develop efficiency and effectiveness measures

PROGRAM GOALS: ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT REVOLVING LOAN PROGRAM

- To operate a revolving loan program that complies with all regulatory requirements
- To effectively and efficiently operate a loan program that addresses the financial needs of the small business community that are not addressed through conventional lending sources
- To provide business and job opportunities, that otherwise would not be available, for low to moderate income individuals and communities

FY 1998-1999 OBJECTIVES

- Complete program modifications, initiated during FY 97-98, to make the program more responsive to current small business needs, market revised program to the banking community

PROGRAM GOALS: ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT LOAN PORTFOLIO

- To operate a Public/Private Partnership Program that complies with all regulatory requirements
- To effectively and efficiently operate a partnership program that addresses the financial needs of the small business community that are not addressed through conventional lending sources
- To provide business and job opportunities, that otherwise would not be available, for low to moderate income individuals and communities

FY 1998-1999 OBJECTIVES

- Develop additional effective and efficiency measures

PROGRAM GOALS: SMALL BUSINESS ASSISTANCE AND REFERRAL

- To provide business assistance and referrals to entrepreneurs seeking to become successful owners/operators of small businesses
- To identify and to assist or refer loan applicants lacking the necessary knowledge, skills, and abilities to successfully operate their business

FY 1998-1999 OBJECTIVES

- Increase the number of general referrals to technical assistance agencies and the number of successful loan referrals back to the City loan program

PROGRAM GOALS: SISTER CITIES INTERNATIONAL PROGRAM

- To develop a municipal partnership between Winston-Salem and similar jurisdictions in other nations
- To create opportunities for the citizens of Winston-Salem to experience and explore other cultures through long-term municipal partnerships
- To create an atmosphere in which economic development and trade opportunities can be developed, implemented, and strengthened

FY 1998-1999 OBJECTIVES

- A Sister Cities International Board of Directors established, and a formal relationship developed with an international city
- Develop additional effectiveness and efficiency measures

PROGRAM GOALS: ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT LIAISON

- To identify and assist agencies seeking to promote economic development opportunities, including but not limited, to the retention and expansion of local businesses within the Enterprise Community or throughout the community

FY 1998-1999 OBJECTIVES

- As part of the expanded responsibilities of this office, we will seek to develop a strong working relationship with the Chamber of Commerce

PROGRAM GOALS: ADMINISTRATION

- To provide training, leadership, planning, and budgetary oversight for the Enterprise Community/Business Development Office
- To provide technical assistance and staff support to the Economic Development Revolving Loan Committee and the East Winston Development Task Force
- To maintain budgetary oversight of the Commercial Loan budget, the East Winston Demonstration Projects budget, and the Brownfield Initiative budget all within the Capital Improvement Program

FY 1998-1999 OBJECTIVES

- Replace East Winston Development Task Force with a development corporation
- Develop efficiency measures

BENCHMARKING

The committee received several pieces of information to be used for benchmarking purposes. The city's development office provided additional assistance in preparing materials to compare comparable programs.

Program Staffing Comparisons

City	ED/Downtown	Small Business	M/WBE	Total
Winston-Salem	1.7	1.8	1.8	5.3
Charlotte	5	7*	2	14
Durham	9	5	7	21
Greensboro	1.5	-	4	5.5
Raleigh	3	.5	.5	4
Richmond*	-	-	-	10
Greenville, SC**	-	-	-	6

*Includes Sister City Programs

**A benchmark for each classification for Richmond and Greenville, SC was not available

Program Budget Comparisons
M/WBE

Winston-Salem	\$93,830
Charlotte	\$239,285
Asheville	\$148,003
Durham	N/A
Greensboro	\$235,000
Raleigh	\$35,370

Program Budget Comparisons
Small Business Development

Winston-Salem	\$93,830
Charlotte	\$422,760
Durham	\$350,000
Greensboro	\$108,000
Raleigh	\$35,370

BEST PRACTICES ANALYSIS

The "Best Practices" information that was provided to the team was too general in nature to allow for a specific analysis of best practices. Based on a review of the materials provided, it appears that the City of Winston-Salem Community Development Department's Economic Development, Enterprise Community and M/WBE programs are consistent in their programming with the "Best Practices" provided.

One clear conclusion in the "Best Practices" analysis is that Winston-Salem has both a smaller staff resource and less program dollars than other comparable cities, with the exception of Raleigh. According to the staff, Raleigh uses a lot of outsource support for these programs.

STATEMENT OF CONDITION

PERFORMANCE VS GOALS

The economic development department established specific goals in three program areas. The Economic Development Projects and Downtown Development both exceeded their goals. Results were not available for the Loan Program.

The M/WBE program established goals in five program areas. There was not enough information to determine success or failure with most of these goals. The program does list a number of accomplishments indicating that they are moving toward achieving the stated goals. The Bids program did meet its goals while the Section 3 programs did not.

The Enterprise Community/Business Development Department is a relatively new department within the city. The department has established goals in ten program areas, but has not been a department long enough to determine whether goals have been met or not. A number of key accomplishments for programs year 1997-98 are listed, indicating that the department is focused on moving toward its goals.

SIGNIFICANCE OF FINDINGS

When compared to other comparable cities, the Economic Development, M/WBE and Enterprise Community/Business Development offices under the Community Development Department provide services at a lower cost than the other cities except for Raleigh. Based on discussion with staff, Raleigh provides these services by utilizing local non-profits. The actual financial results for each program are listed below.

Community Development Program Expenses

Program	1996-97 Actual	1997-98 Actual
Economic Development	\$211,870	\$227,127
M/WBE	\$87,482	\$93,355
Enterprise Comm/Business Development	\$96,653	\$90,842
Total	\$396,005	\$411,324

RECOMMENDATIONS

FINDING

Winston-Salem has a smaller staff and less program dollars than comparable cities.

RECOMMENDATION

Explore opportunities for outsourcing of selected programs to the Chamber of Commerce, the Downtown Development Corporation and the Central Winston-Salem Association.

FINDING

Lack of quality information about best practices made it difficult/impossible to include a specific analysis.

RECOMMENDATION

More benchmarking and best practices analysis should be conducted.

FINDING

Current staff are located in separate offices.

RECOMMENDATION

Consolidate staff in one location to improve communication.

HOUSING & NEIGHBORHOOD DEVELOPMENT

REVIEW TEAM BACKGROUND ANALYSIS AND SCOPE OF WORK

REVIEW

MISSION STATEMENT

The mission of the Housing/Neighborhood Development Department is to develop housing and neighborhood revitalization plans and programs that accurately reflect local needs and conditions and citizens' desired strategies and outcomes and to effectively and efficiently coordinate the implementation and administration of adopted plans and programs.

INTERNAL GOAL SETTING

PROGRAM GOALS: PLANNING AND EVALUATION

- Facilitate and coordinate the development of a Consolidated Plan that accurately reflects local community needs/conditions and citizen desired strategies and outcomes
- Complete annual performance assessment of Consolidated Plan and Homeless Continuum of Care accomplishments to assure that changing conditions and needs are addressed and to support HUD and other grant applications
- Provide exceptional service to City departments, community agencies and neighborhood organizations in designing and implementing strategies and/or programs to address community development needs
- Provide technical assistance to Forsyth County, the Housing Authority of Winston-Salem, nonprofit agencies and other state and local government organizations in the spirit of interjurisdictional cooperation and modeling of exceptional community development programs

FY 1998-1999 OBJECTIVES

- Develop program performance benchmarks for Neighborhood Revitalization Strategy and submit to HUD for approval of Neighborhood Revitalization Area
- Prepare and submit and/or assist in preparation of funding applications for Education and Outreach (Fair Housing Initiative), Community Outreach and Partnership Center Initiative (HUD University Initiative), Downtown Revitalization (Economic Development Initiative and Section 108 Loan), Supportive Housing Program on behalf of non-profit homeless service providers, Empowerment Zone and State Development Zone
- Coordinate redevelopment plan process for Northeast Winston #2 Redevelopment plan
- Attain bids and contract Supportive Housing Program Evaluation
- Develop HOME TBRA pilot program for persons with disabilities
- Develop policies and procedures for Neighborhood CDC Capacity Building grants

PROGRAM GOALS: ADMINISTRATION AND OVERSIGHT

- To assure that all funded activities are implemented in compliance with applicable and appropriate regulatory requirements
- To collect, aggregate and analyze performance data from City departments, Forsyth County, HAWS, sub-grantee agencies and other agencies and organizations for preparation of periodic and annual performance reports
- To update and maintain current performance databases on a quarterly basis to allow for program management review assessment and implementation adjustments
- To promote citizen participation in program planning, development, implementation and performance assessment and participation of all the segments of the community in funded activities

FY 1998-1999 OBJECTIVES

- Preparation and timely submission of CAPER (HUD Consolidated Plan Performance report) with new and revised reporting requirements
- Preparation and publication of 1994-1998 Five-Year Housing and Redevelopment Performance Report

PROGRAM GOALS: HOUSING ASSISTANCE AND NEIGHBORHOOD REVITALIZATION

- To form partnerships with non-profit corporations, employers, lenders, churches, foundations and service agencies to cultivate housing and employment opportunities and to coordinate support services essential to making housing accessible for families and for populations with special housing needs
- To increase the supply of housing units affordable for low and moderate income households
- Optimize the leverage of private sector resources and limit public funds to closing "gaps" that otherwise render development infeasible
- To develop an informed and prepared pool of 250 first-time home buyers
- Provide exceptional service to citizens and community agencies in identifying and addressing shelter and service needs

FY 1998-1999 OBJECTIVES

- Complete acquisition, clearance, engineering, infrastructure improvements and initiate unit construction in Lincoln-Maywood and Old Cherry redevelopment areas. Initiate acquisition in Northeast Winston No. 2 following plan adoption
- Complete development and sale of homes in Pleasant Hills and East Winston No. 5
- Provide home ownership counseling and education to prepare up to 250 home buyers
- Finalize negotiations with preferred developer to resume development in the Salem Pointe subdivision
- Initiate development and sales in Andrews Height and Vulcan Quarry
- Work with other local agencies to establish a Home Buyer Counseling/Education program open to all citizens and available on a regular basis
- Develop efficiency performance measures for this program

RECOMMENDATIONS

- An increase in communication is needed. Non-profit, private sector partnerships need to be increased.
- A peer evaluation group needs to be implemented.
- A low-income housing qualifying standard needs to be implemented. Income limits need to be adopted by the city when released by HUD.
- Slum/blighted area designations need to be updated on an annual basis.

CITIZEN AND EMPLOYEE PERCEPTIONS

CITIZEN PERCEPTIONS

Non-profit organizations feel like it is difficult to communicate with the department head (See Exhibit A).

EMPLOYEE PERCEPTIONS

The success of department efforts to expand resources has been optimized by the use of grantsmanship and personal service contracts which augment department staff capabilities.

Staff are committed to giving excellent customer service on all inquiries.

HOUSING & NEIGHBORHOOD SERVICES



REVIEW TEAM BACKGROUND ANALYSIS AND SCOPE OF WORK

REVIEW

MISSION STATEMENT

The mission of the Housing and Neighborhood Services Department is to conserve and improve the City's existing housing stock, promote the stabilization and revitalization of deteriorating and disadvantaged neighborhoods and provide assistance in the planning and implementation of improvements that a neighborhood may wish to undertake.

INTERNAL GOAL SETTING

PROGRAM GOALS: HOUSING REHABILITATION

- To provide financial and technical assistance to encourage property owners in correction substandard housing conditions that are detrimental to the public health, safety and welfare
- To provide a mechanism to conserve the City's existing housing stock
- To create home ownership opportunities for low and moderate income households

FY 1998-1999 OBJECTIVES

- Continue efforts to gradually shift the focus from substantial rehabilitation to repair and preventive maintenance
- Continue with efforts to reduce per unit costs of program assistance through leveraging public and private financing
- Utilize hazard reduction grant to educate the public on the hazards of lead-based paint/asbestos and abate these hazards from the existing housing stock

PROGRAM GOALS: CODE ENFORCEMENT: MINIMUM HOUSING

- To inspect a minimum of 8% of the City's total housing stock each year
- Bring into compliance at least 80% of units found to be substandard
- To provide timely and quality services to all customers

FY 1998-1999 OBJECTIVES

- Develop a program to encourage neighborhood participation in resolving code violations (Citizens on Patrol)
- Develop a Vacant Lot Abatement Retainer Program and the Flower Power Program to address illegal dumping
- Resolve issues relating to hand held automated field devices for code inspectors and purchase devices
- Resolve issues relating to processing initial inspection documents in a timely manner in order to be in compliance with the appropriate ordinances, and minimize citizen complaints
- Develop a Code Enforcement Standard Operating Procedures Manual
- Develop written guidelines for the demolition of structures

PROGRAM GOALS: CODE ENFORCEMENT: ABANDONED VEHICLES

- To identify and remove abandoned vehicles from City streets that interfere with the public's right to free passage
- To identify and remove abandoned vehicles from private property that pose a safety and/or health problem to persons nearby
- To remove abandoned vehicles from highways that pose a safety problem for on-going traffic

FY 1998-1999 OBJECTIVES

- Improve security at the abandoned vehicle storage lot to help reduce vandalism
- Develop efficiency performance measures for this program

PROGRAM GOALS: CODE ENFORCEMENT: SANITATION

- To eliminate nuisance conditions to ensure that neighborhoods are clean, safe, and conducive to a healthy living environment
- To eliminate small animal and rodent harborage
- To assist in neighborhood beautification
- To provide timely and quality service to all customers

FY 1998-1999 OBJECTIVES

- Propose new ordinances to address the following: (1) Cutting/trimming and/or removing bushes that pose a safety or health problem on public and private property (2) Persons blowing, placing or allowing to be placed or permitting to continue the accumulation of leaves, grass clippings, or any other debris from their premises on a public street, sidewalk, grass strip between a paved sidewalk and street, or on an area that pedestrians would be expected to walk
- Propose changes to existing environmental ordinance to improve enforcement efforts such as, reducing the compliance time from ten (10) to seven (7) days
- Continue to educate citizens on conditions that attract rodents and disseminate educational material pertaining to the rodent control program

PROGRAM GOALS: COMMUNITY SERVICES: RELOCATION

- To ensure that residential and commercial property owners and/or tenants who are displaced by government action are relocated to suitable replacement sites in a timely manner

FY 1998-1999 OBJECTIVES

- Assisting displacees in finding standard, affordable replacement housing (particularly for Code Enforcement displacees) whose credit histories, rental histories, and criminal records prohibit such placement
- Establishing comparable (decent, safe and sanitary housing that is functionally equivalent to the displacement site) affordable replacement housing for homeowner displacees when generally the property that is being acquired is in neighborhoods that have been determined to be undesirable

PROGRAM GOALS: COMMUNITY SERVICES: COUNSELING

- To provide counseling to delinquent loan cases referred by the City's Revenue Department in order to prevent foreclosure
- Presenting seminars in various neighborhoods to make citizens aware of the programs that are offered by the department that are assisting in neighborhood improvement efforts
- Holding pre- and post- construction interviews with rehabilitation program applicants/recipients to assess services provided by Housing and Rehabilitation staff and program contractors

FY 1998-1999 OBJECTIVES

- Finding suitable creative ways to market the department's programs that will help increase participation
- Develop performance measures regarding the percentage of loan applications generated resulting from seminars held in neighborhoods

PROGRAM GOALS: COMMUNITY SERVICES: NEIGHBORHOOD SERVICES

- Provide assistance in the planning and implementation of improvements that a neighborhood may wish to undertake
- To act as a liaison between neighborhoods and specific City departments and divisions relative to the delivery of services

- To improve communications between the City and the neighborhoods

FY 1998-1999 OBJECTIVES

- Assist neighborhoods in establishing a city-wide neighborhood council of representatives from various neighborhood associations which will allow them to share information about common problems and successful solutions with each other
- Create a directory of resources available to neighborhoods to empower neighborhoods to reach their own solutions without city intervention (unless called for)
- Add a neighborhood news section to the existing departmental newsletter, Eye on Housing
- Explore the possibility of creating interdepartmental action teams to resolve unusual neighborhood problems that do not require standard city response methods
- Develop performance measures for improving communications between the City and neighborhoods

PROGRAM GOALS: PROGRAM ADMINISTRATION

- Provide leadership, management, coordinating and fiscal stewardship of departmental programs

RECOMMENDATIONS

FINDING

More than one Assistant City Attorney is assigned to code enforcement.

RECOMMENDATION

Only one City Attorney needs to be used to assist with Housing Services.

FINDING

Multiple computer systems are used to track data.

RECOMMENDATION

Code enforcement process needs to be integrated into one computer system.

FINDING

Code inspectors have a tremendous volume of paperwork.

RECOMMENDATION

Inspectors need to have automated hand-held field devices.

FINDING

Some property owners do not accept violation notifications sent as certified mail.

RECOMMENDATION

One inspector or staff person needs to be designated to deliver housing violation notifications. Consider outsourcing this function.

FINDING

Redundant violation codes exist.

RECOMMENDATION

Housing inspection codes need to be updated on an annual basis.

FINDING

Processing abandoned vehicles is time consuming.

RECOMMENDATION

Privatize the abandoned vehicle section (See Exhibit A for additional information).

FINDING

Curbside waste removal is shared between the Sanitation Department and Housing/Neighborhood Services.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The sanitation division needs to be removed from housing services and placed back into the Division of Sanitation. Therefore, curbside pick-up should go back to being the Sanitation division's responsibility. Curb-side pick-up should be re-instituted on a weekly basis in targeted areas. Further investigation needs to be done on privatizing curb-side pick-up.

FINDING

Environmental control code violations are printed in Spanish.

RECOMMENDATION

Violation notifications should be printed in Spanish as well as English.

FINDING

There are no checks and balances to ensure that money is handled properly.

RECOMMENDATION

The City Revenue Department should collect and account for fees or monies that come in for Neighborhood Housing Services.

FINDING

Personal computers are not networked.

RECOMMENDATION

The staff need to have networked personal computers.

CITIZEN AND EMPLOYEE PERCEPTIONS

CITIZEN PERCEPTIONS

- Inconsistencies in code enforcement procedures as it pertains to minimum housing nuisance and sanitation violations

- Inspectors conduct systematic inspections in order to meet a quota
- Tenants are not held responsible for any damage done to the property in which they live on. The property owner is held solely responsible for upkeep and damages
- Owner-occupants are dissatisfied with the way the city handles inspections
- Communication needs to be increased between the owners of property and the division of Housing and Neighborhood Services

EMPLOYEE PERCEPTIONS

- Action orders should only be created on compliant and requested inspections
- Abandoned vehicle paperwork should be kept in the possession of the inspector until the car is towed or removed by the owner. After compliance has been met, then the documents should be turned in for data entry
- A summary of an internal survey completed by employees within Community Development is available in Exhibit B

NEIGHBORHOOD CENTER



REVIEW TEAM BACKGROUND ANALYSIS AND SCOPE OF WORK

REVIEW

MISSION STATEMENT

The mission of the Black-Phillip-Smith Neighborhood Government Services Office is to serve as a convenient, one-stop, user-friendly City Hall satellite which schedules and hosts varied informational sessions presented by government, non-profit and private partners with the aim of removing obstacles toward achieving full citizen empowerment.

INTERNAL GOAL SETTING

PROGRAM GOALS: EDUCATIONAL AND TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE

- Provide varied informational programs relating to government and other services for city residents of all ages by partnering with government, non-profit and private entities

FY 1998-1999 OBJECTIVES

- Seek additional empowerment opportunities to offer citizens

PROGRAM GOALS: FACILITIES

- Provide complimentary meeting space for neighborhood meetings and non-profit groups

FY 1998-1999 OBJECTIVES

- Provide Internet web page containing the application for use of meeting rooms

PROGRAM GOALS: PUBLICITY

- Provide public presentations to citizens and calendar of events

FY 1998-1999 OBJECTIVES

- To provide leadership, planning and fiscal stewardship

RECOMMENDATIONS

FINDING

The present staff are doing an outstanding job considering the limited resources and funding they have. These City employees go above and beyond the call of duty and their job description.

RECOMMENDATION

An increase in the budget is needed to increase the salary of existing staff and to hire additional staff. A face-lift is also needed on the building's sign.

FINDING

The Neighborhood Center has evolved to become a Resource Center for local citizens who don't know how to begin to advocate for themselves.

RECOMMENDATION

Outreach to other communities needs to be done (establish centers on north and south sides of town).

CITIZEN AND EMPLOYEE PERCEPTIONS

CITIZEN PERCEPTIONS

- The present staff members at the Black-Phillip-Smith Neighborhood Services Center are doing an outstanding job considering the limited resources and funding that they have to work with
- These City employees go above and beyond the call of duty and their job descriptions
- An increase is needed in their budget to increase the great works the program is doing

EMPLOYEE PERCEPTIONS

- The center has evolved to become a Resource Center for local citizens who don't know how to begin to advocate for themselves
- The Neighborhood Government Services Office currently utilizes a mix of in-house resources to assist citizens with concerns related to the local, state, and federal government
- The division has been successful in addressing the "total needs" of the community

INSPECTIONS



REVIEW

MISSION STATEMENT

The mission of the Inspections Division is to provide fair, consistent, and timely enforcement of the North Carolina State Building Code and the Unified Development Ordinance for protection of life, health, property, the environment and for the safety and general welfare of the public.

The Winston-Salem/Forsyth County Inspections Division has impressed our team as being well organized, consisting of highly qualified professionals who have excellent management. It is our opinion at this point that the Division is performing its mission under very tight financial constraints with limited personnel and revenue.

INTERNAL GOAL SETTING

PROGRAM GOALS: ZONING ENFORCEMENT

- To enforce the Unified Zoning Ordinance requirements for building construction and land use
- To provide staff support for the Winston-Salem, Forsyth County, Lewisville, and Clemmons Boards of Adjustment
- To bring reported zoning violations into compliance

FY 1998-1999 OBJECTIVES

- Implement amortizations required by the Unified Development Ordinance
- Automate the application and record process for the Zoning Board of Adjustment
- Develop efficiency performance measures for this program

PROGRAM GOALS: CONSTRUCTION CONTROL

- To issue residential permits within 3 days
- To issue commercial and multi-family permits within 9 days
- To respond to requests for inspections within one day
- To assure that completed buildings meet Building Code within quality assurance standards

FY 1998-1999 OBJECTIVES

- Complete the implementation of the in-car computers and automated permit issuance system
- Analyze our customer service clerk needs based on the workload transferred to the automated system
- Develop a plan for a stand-alone commercial plan review section
- Develop preliminary costs and plans for converting our mainframe permitting system to a client server system
- Implement procedural changes necessary to obtain a rating of 3 on the next Insurance Service Organization operational review
- Develop quality assurance standards

PROGRAM GOALS: EROSION CONTROL

- To reduce off-site sedimentation and water pollution by enforcing the Erosion Control and Watershed sections of the Unified Development Ordinance
- To provide public safety, prevent property damage, and maintain eligibility in the National Insurance Program by enforcement of the Floodplain sections of the Unified Development Ordinance

FY 1998-1999 OBJECTIVES

- Maintain a no deficiencies rating for both the erosion control and floodplain management programs

- Develop, implement, and publicize procedures for permitting and inspecting retaining walls
- Develop efficiency performance measures for this program

RECOMMENDATIONS

FINDING

The Inspection Division is an ideal candidate to be operated as an Enterprise Fund. Every effort should be made to avoid Clemmons and Lewisville from opening their own Inspection Division. Kernersville should be encouraged to come back into the W-S/Forsyth County Inspection Division.

RECOMMENDATION

Operate the division as an Enterprise Fund with central and possibly satellite offices to handle the total county. Focus on having all local municipalities participate.

FINDING

Functions are disjointed making processes cumbersome.

RECOMMENDATION

Work toward a "One Stop Shopping" concept so that a developer, design professional, building contractor or the public at large would have one general location for all of their requirements. Planning involving the new "City Hall South" should address this need.

FINDING

Of the 800 yearly adjustment cases before the Board of Adjustment, more than 70% relate to Manufactured Housing on individual lots. High levels of involvement are required by the staff of the Inspections Division. There is a large demand for affordable single family housing, but limited availability due to the zoning issues.

RECOMMENDATION

There is a need for better education of the public about manufactured housing. A good planned development should be built as an example. Manufactured housing should be permitted by right in certain areas with code restrictions and inspections.

FINDING

The computer systems serving the City and the County are incompatible.

RECOMMENDATION

The City and County governments must establish and work toward a goal of compatibility of their computer systems and maintain state-of-the-art technology.

FINDING

Delays in reviewing plans.

RECOMMENDATION

Institute a "Stand Alone Plan Review" with plan checkers dedicated to reviewing plans. Reviewers would act as code/permit consultants resolving/coordinating/expediting issues and revisions.

FINDING

Tank Inspections includes storage tanks for liquids, both flammable and nonflammable. This is part of the Fire Prevention Code and would be better handled by the Fire Marshals.

RECOMMENDATION

Responsibility for tank inspections should be with the Fire Department.

CITIZEN AND EMPLOYEE PERCEPTIONS

EMPLOYEE PERCEPTIONS

- Find way to hire more staff
- Pay raise/percentage increase
- Let inspectors take cars home to go directly to sites
- Improve customer service
- Purchase Nextel type paging and phones

INTERNAL SURVEY RESULTS

- Ten questionnaires returned with 70% from employees with over 10 years of service
- "Smartest Things Department Does" - 60% responded "Good Customer Service"
- "Dumbest Things Department Does" - 70% responded "Low Salaries/Low Benefits"
- "Thing Liked Best About Job" - 40% responded "Helping People/Assist Elderly"
- "Thing Liked Least About Job" - 30% responded "Low Pay" and "Insufficient Staff"

CUSTOMER SERVICE SURVEY

- Eighty-eight (88) responses
- 76% answered yes to the question "Are you receiving the kind of service you want from the Inspections Division?"
- "What word best describes your feeling about our operation?" - 51% said "Efficient", 12% said "Professional", 16% said "Aggravating"
- Overall results of the survey were positive

WORKFORCE DEVELOPMENT



REVIEW TEAM BACKGROUND ANALYSIS AND SCOPE OF WORK

REVIEW

The review team for Workforce Development did not complete a report. The team received little cooperation from the department in attaining information. The mission statement and internal goals are listed below. Exhibit A is a letter from the Subcommittee Chair that describes her impressions of Workforce Development. Exhibit B is a memo from the Director of Workforce Development that answers several of the questions asked by the review team.

MISSION STATEMENT

The mission of the Workforce Development Department is to enhance the quality of life and economic well-being of community residents by providing quality job training programs and services which contribute to a high-quality workforce.

INTERNAL GOAL SETTING

PROGRAM GOALS: YEAR-ROUND ADULT PROGRAM

- Operate a comprehensive job training program designed to reduce welfare dependency, increase household earnings and enhance the employment potential of economically disadvantaged adults facing serious barriers to employment
- Provide opportunities for unemployed and unskilled economically disadvantaged persons to become productive labor force participants and contributors to the federal, state, and local tax base
- Assist area businesses in meeting their specific hiring needs by sponsoring skill training activities in high demand occupational areas

FY 1998-1999 OBJECTIVES

- Develop a comprehensive job training plan to assist eligible unemployed and unskilled persons (adults) in obtaining gainful employment
- Target high demand occupational areas for training to ensure the likelihood of program participants obtaining jobs paying decent wages
- Develop efficiency performance measures for this program

PROGRAM GOALS: YEAR-ROUND YOUTH PROGRAM

- Operate a comprehensive job training program designed to enhance the educational, occupational, and basic life skills of economically disadvantaged youth
- Provide opportunities for targeted youth to successfully transition from school-to-work

FY 1998-1999 OBJECTIVES

- Target high demand occupational areas for training to ensure the likelihood of program participants obtaining jobs paying decent wages
- Reduce the incidence of unemployment among participating youths by placing them in appropriate job training programs, services, and/or activities
- Develop efficiency performance measures for this program

PROGRAM GOALS: SUMMER YOUTH EMPLOYMENT PROGRAM

- Administer and operate a summer youth employment program consistent with all applicable federal guidelines and requirements
- Operate a summer youth employment program that maximizes work-based learning and training opportunities for participating youths
- Operate a summer youth employment program that provides positive and productive experiences for youths during the out-of-school months
- Provide opportunities for participating worksite agencies (public and private non-profit) to contribute to the employability development of youths while benefitting from additional help during the summer months
- Provide opportunities for participating youths to gain meaningful and rewarding work experience

FY 1998-1999 OBJECTIVES

- Plan for the successful implementation of the 1999 Summer Youth Employment Program utilizing available financial resources
- Recruit program participants in cooperation with community based organizations
- Develop efficiency performance measures for this program

PROGRAM GOALS: JOBLINK CAREER CENTER

- Operate a strong customer-focused (i.e., job and training seekers and employers) center which continuously strives for improvement in career guidance, job training and job placement
- Operate a high-performance results-oriented center which delivers superior job training and job placement results
- Provide opportunities for center staff to further develop their expertise which will aid in more efficient and effective delivery of customer services
- Provide an adequate set of information management products and tools for effective center management

FY 1998-1999 OBJECTIVES

- Develop and implement a full-scale JobLink Marketing Plan to include components such as public relations, electronic media, print media, transit media, etc.

PROGRAM GOALS: WORK FIRST JOB PLACEMENT PROGRAM

- Contribute to the reduction of welfare dependency among economically disadvantaged persons
- Promote self-sufficiency among welfare recipients
- Provide opportunities for welfare recipients to become productive labor force participants and contributors to the federal, state and local tax base

FY 1998-1999 OBJECTIVES

- Develop efficiency performance measures for this program

PROGRAM GOALS: SECTION 3 CONSTRUCTION TRAINING PROGRAM

- Oversee the planning, development and operation of the Section 3 Construction Training program carried out in coordination with the community development efforts of the city
- Provide unskilled and/or unemployed individuals the opportunity to learn skills utilized in the construction field
- Increase the number of well-trained construction workers available to meet the hiring needs of local contractors and sub-contractors
- Maintain cooperative working relationships with other key partnering agencies, training institutions and businesses
- Provide job placement assistance to program participants with emphasis on placement in the construction field

FY 1998-1999 OBJECTIVES

- Strengthen coordination with a special apprenticeship program administered by Forsyth Technical Community College in cooperation with local building contractors
- Place special emphasis on recruiting females, at-risk youth (18-21), ex-offenders, minority males (22-35) and homeless individuals for program participation
- Develop efficiency performance measures for this program

PROGRAM GOALS: YOUTH SERVICE CORPS PROGRAM

- Operate a youth service corps program which provides alternatives for at-risk youth between the ages of 18-23
- Assist drop-outs in obtaining their high school equivalency certification
- Provide a combination of program services and activities which strengthen and enhance the life coping skills of program participants
- Serve as a cost efficient resource for addressing unmet community service and emergency response needs in the Winston-Salem/Forsyth County area (i.e. the corps provides volunteer services and low cost work)

FY 1998-1999 OBJECTIVES

- Provide ABE/GED training opportunities for high school drop outs
- Develop and improve the attitudes, behaviors and skills required for young adults to be successful in the workplace
- Continue to place special emphasis on raising/generating monetary resources
- Maintain cooperative working relationships with other community agencies to provide needed services for corps members
- Develop efficiency performance measures for this program

PROGRAM GOALS: GENERAL EMPLOYMENT ASSISTANCE PROGRAM

- Assist community residents, regardless of their economic status, who may be in need of special assistance in order to obtain employment
- Provide employment and training services to individuals facing serious barriers to employment and who for various reasons are not suited for JTPA Program participation

FY 1998-1999 OBJECTIVES

- Work cooperatively with local businesses in the public and private sectors in tailoring services to their particular needs
- Develop efficiency performance measures for this program

PROGRAM GOALS: WORKFORCE DEVELOPMENT BOARD STAFF SUPPORT

- To provide staff and administrative support to the Winston-Salem/Forsyth County Workforce Development Board
- To plan and carry out monthly board meetings
- To provide staff support to committees of the board
- To prepare and submit reports and documents to the board as necessary and required

FY 1998-1999 OBJECTIVES

- Serve as the administrative entity on behalf of the board in implementing the new Welfare-to-Work initiative

PROGRAM GOALS: PROGRAM ADMINISTRATION

- To provide leadership, strategic planning, results-oriented management, capacity building and fiscal stewardship for the city/county workforce development program operation
- To be a high performing operation with emphasis on providing quality service and 100% customer satisfaction



PLANNING

REVIEW TEAM BACKGROUND ANALYSIS AND SCOPE OF WORK

REVIEW

The subcommittee of the Community Development Review Team assigned to the City-County Planning Department approached its work with due regard for the difficulty of assessing efficiency in this area. The Planning Department is charged with responsibility for improving the quality of life in this county through application of the Unified Development Ordinance to current projects as well as through medium and long range planning. The staff operates under the supervision of the City-County Planning Board, and the office's efficiency is, in large measure, a result of that board's action and policy. Additionally, there is no "product" which can be easily quantified. Success is measured "one project at a time" and yet also by the overall achievement of good long-term planning, which is felt and understood in various ways by the members of

this community. The current efforts of the Planning Department will make Winston-Salem and Forsyth County a better place ten, twenty, even fifty years from now, though we may not appreciate it or even realize it.

It is also important to emphasize that the efficiency of the Planning Department is subject to the strong political forces over which the staff has no control. The best efforts of the staff could be obscured or blocked by a politically driven decision.

Therefore, we acknowledge the limitations on our review, and on the power of the staff to effect change. We have not however, limited our recommendations only to those matters which the staff could unilaterally respond. We have looked for systemic issues which we could identify as needing attention or which prevent the staff from working on more important tasks. It was our overall assessment that the staff is accomplishing as much as can be expected in their current situation, and at current staffing levels. There is no activity which we could identify that was needlessly receiving attention, but there were many which needed more attention. Current jobs need to be done more efficiently so that important jobs can be assigned.

Perhaps more than any other division of government, the planning office can be viewed as an investment in the future. Winston-Salem and Forsyth County may seem to be heavily developed in some ways, but 1999, for future generations, will undoubtedly seem to be a threshold of sorts – opportunities exist today to shape our future which will disappear year by year. Much of what will dictate the quality of life in 2025 will take place in the next five years in the Planning Department.

MISSION STATEMENT

The mission of the City-County Planning Board of Winston-Salem and Forsyth County is to assert visionary leadership in comprehensive, creative planning for our urban and rural community, and responsible stewardship of the natural environment. We value a beautiful, livable, harmonious, and economically successful community.

INTERNAL GOAL SETTING

PROGRAM GOALS: COMPREHENSIVE PLANNING

- To prepare and publish a comprehensive plan for Forsyth County and its municipalities
- To conduct a planning process that involves a broad cross section of the public resulting in community consensus on the goals of the comprehensive plan and implementation of the plan's recommendations by public and private groups
- To coordinate successful implementation of the policies and action agenda of the comprehensive plan
- To conduct an annual review, using benchmark measures, of progress in implementing the comprehensive plan and a major assessment of the plan at five year intervals

FY 1998-1999 OBJECTIVES

- Complete drafts of all chapters of LEGACY and review them with Citizens Steering Committee and the Planning Board
- Begin an adoption process to include recommendation by the Planning Board and adoption by all units of government in Forsyth County
- Develop effectiveness and efficiency performance measures for this program

PROGRAM GOALS: COMMUNITY PLANNING

- To publish small area studies, including sector plans, development guides, redevelopment plans, and design studies for various parts of the county that outline the policies set out in the comprehensive plan and have broad community support
- To ensure that public facilities are located to meet public needs and in accordance with the comprehensive plan
- To ensure that all City and County housing and community development projects proposed to be funded with Federal grant funds are reviewed for potential impact on the built and natural environment, and for compliance with applicable Federal law and regulations

- To ensure the use of small studies as an important determinant of capital improvements and other public investments

FY 1998-1999 OBJECTIVES

- Define and establish development policies for the elements of the Legacy Growth Management Plan—three levels of activity centers, transit oriented developments, and urban boulevards - as a framework for sector plans and development guides
- Add Forsyth County Housing Department to E-mail request/return system
- Review UDO for any changes needed to implement the Downtown Plan and recommend those changes to the Planning Board
- Provide planning staff support to Downtown Development Corporation as requested to assist in implementation of Downtown Plan
- Develop effectiveness and efficiency performance measures for this program

PROGRAM GOALS: COMMUNITY CHARACTER AND DESIGN

- To continue the work of effective community character commissions (HPC, HDC, CAC, YRC) which carry out their mandates through our administrative and professional staff support
- To provide quality professional assistance and information in historical resource management, natural resource management, and design as requested by the community character commissions, the Planning Board, other Forsyth County communities, elected officials, and other local government departments
- To conduct thorough reviews of development plans, resulting in well designed public and private land development which conforms with recommendations in the comprehensive plan and makes a positive contribution to our community's image
- To promote regional cooperation on issues related to the Yadkin River
- To seek state and federal monies to support program

FY 1998-1999 OBJECTIVES

- Increase the commissions' participation in the earlier stages of public projects by communicating with department heads quarterly
- Begin the 1999 Biennial Awards Program process for CAC
- Conduct a meeting to include other appearance commissions and beautification committees in the county to discuss common community appearance issues
- Develop a Community Crossing signage plan
- Revise design review guidelines and Certificate of Appropriateness process for Historic Properties Commission
- Begin work on Phase 4 of the African American Historic Resources Project, including seven National Register of Historic Places nominations
- Complete Design Review Guidelines for Historic Bethabara
- Begin Design Review Guidelines for Old Salem Historic District
- Design, print and mail a brochure to all property owners in historic districts
- Develop effectiveness and efficiency performance measures for this program

PROGRAM GOALS: DEVELOPMENT REVIEW

- To process all development requests in accordance with established schedules
- To make recommendations on all development requests and amendments to the UDO based on adopted plans and consideration of broad public interest. To prepare written reports on all Planning Board recommendations provided to the governing boards in accordance with established schedules
- To accurately present Planning Board recommendations at all Board of Aldermen and Board of County Commissioner meetings
- To provide accurate and timely information and excellent customer service at the public zoning counter

FY 1998-1999 OBJECTIVES

- Work with City and County staff to provide land records information on the Internet, thereby reducing the number of times citizens call or visit the planning office. This will enable staff to devote more time to customer service at the zoning counter
- Strengthen and improve zoning case reports by beginning to use Legacy recommendations
- Study work flow and schedule at the zoning counter, seeking ways to improve customer service
- Build computer data base of subdivision files
- Develop effectiveness and efficiency performance measures for this program

PROGRAM GOALS: GIS AND GRAPHIC SUPPORT

- To provide accurate maps and geographic-based data to the planning staff, other City and County departments, and the public through use of the GIS
- To provide clear and accurate graphics and publications to support the Planning Board's plans and projects
- To create and maintain a variety of geographic data layers on the City/County GIS as a basis for the Planning Department's plans and projects
- To provide accurate and timely census data, maps, aerial photographs, and other information to planning staff, other City and County departments, and the public

FY 1998-1999 OBJECTIVES

- Build computer database of subdivision files
- Make land records information more available to all staff by working with City and County staff to get the information on the Internet, or by adding Arcview software to computers in each staff section
- Add orthophotography and topographic mapping to the GIS
- Study the possibility of making orthophotographs and topographic mapping available on CD-ROM by acquiring and beginning to use writeable CD-ROM equipment
- Develop effectiveness and efficiency performance measures for this program

STATEMENT OF CONDITION

RE-ZONING PROCESS

It is a common observation among the developer/real estate community that the current re-zoning process is not always fair or predictable. It is probably just as true for the community groups involved and for individual citizens which oppose re-zoning. Therefore, it seemed appropriate to focus on whether the time and resources being spent on re-zoning are necessary.

Most re-zoning is restricted to special use. This was true under the old ordinance, and an objective of the UDO was to reduce the need for re-zoning, and to produce fewer "S" zones. While the committee did not have access to the statistics, this was apparently not achieved. To the citizenry who fill the Aldermen's chamber, to the developers and consultants marshaling their arguments, there seems to be no clarity in many instances about the possible uses to which a property may be put.

The subcommittee would like to make the point that this often adversarial process requires a large portion of the resources of the Planning Department. While this is obvious and solutions clearly are not, this difficulty should not reduce the effort to create new methods which would be in the interest of the public.

The subcommittee was drawn to the importance of area plans as a way of introducing further stability and predictability to the land use system. The provision of current area plans has been stalled, to some degree, by the allocation of resources to current and long-range county-wide planning.

The advantage of the area plan is that it has legitimacy because it is developed with the landowners and citizens of the subject area, and it provides an important context for re-zoning decisions. All parties have an opportunity to contribute

to the plan in a much less highly-charged atmosphere than a re-zoning hearing. When adopted, it provides the Planning Board and governing boards with a type of “presumption” about the specified uses. It is not that this presumption cannot be overcome by circumstances – but that everyone is better off in this economically dominated arena to have some idea about where and what type of change may be acceptable.

Area planning provides the necessary flexibility to the zoning map, which never changes unless a party makes an application. Uses of the land however, are always changing to some degree. To force all changes in the map to come through re-zoning of parcels upon application means that necessary responses to change have to be made in re-zoning hearings.

Additionally, the development of area plans can help achieve another important objective in land use: the introduction of more compact, integrated development patterns. The tendency of owner-initiated re-zoning and the necessary buffering often leads to a patchwork of uses which are not mutually supporting in terms of traffic or services. This development pattern is not only a less efficient use of the land with consequential less satisfactory long-term results, but it also requires more staff time. The subcommittee recognizes the important balance which is struck in this type of policy between the rights of landowners and the public; however, attention needs to be given to the benefits of further identifying areas for development, and creating area plans that promote the concept.

The subcommittee recognizes also that every area or long-range plan is dependent on elected officials to honor the plan. The elected officials’ job in this regard is not easy, but if such plans are not generally affirmed when requests for re-zoning are made, they have much less value.

The subcommittee recommends that adequate resources be allocated to area planning to promote an orderly and predictable pattern of land use changes.

SPECIAL USE ZONING

The issue of too many “S” zones is also a difficult one. It appears to be, in many cases, a compromise between refusing to grant re-zoning and granting the general use zone, which would expose the surrounding landowners to much more uncertainty. Granting the “S” zone is a recognition that a change is appropriate, but that it is not appropriate to allow the unknown uses of a general zone. This is a useful, though not generally liked, tool. Improving the system with current area plans could produce less need for “S” zones. The subcommittee did not find any way to eliminate the usefulness of “S” zones, except when the “S” zone is used to enforce site conditions. In this case, perhaps the development of design guidelines and performance standards for uses generally would eliminate the need to use site specific zoning.

MANUFACTURED HOUSING

Manufactured Housing permits and questions appear to be another area in which changing the process could result in improved efficiency. We were told that there were no manufactured housing zones in Forsyth County. The subcommittee expects that the Inspections Department Subcommittee will devote attention to this area since it has a larger impact on the Inspections Department. It is however, also important to the Planning Department because of the resources required to provide staff for re-zoning requests for manufactured housing districts. While improvements in this area will generally require approval of governing boards, it seems appropriate to focus attention on improvement and the development of clear policies to guide developers and the public.

TECHNOLOGY

Major advances are needed in the use of technology in the entire development review process. Central to these needs is a development review process web page. The web page in its most basic form should be set up immediately. This should include basic information on the process, copies of applications and forms which can be printed out, and contact information for all departments involved in the process. Ultimately, however, the web page should provide much more. Virtually any information relevant to the process, whether from the City, the County, or perhaps even from private resources, should be easily and instantly available to customers on the web site.

We believe that the changing nature of business will require the Department to make key advances in the use of various technologies in order to accommodate the needs of the Department's customers. In particular, the customer of the very near future will demand immediate access to a wide range of scattered information which is relevant to the customer's situation. This will include every type of map of the property (zoning, topo, flood plain, streets, etc.), demographic information, area plan information, staff opinions if for re-zoning, zoning history, and all relevant contact information for the entire development review process. We believe this can all be provided on a web page.

Customers should be able to use the web page to have nearly all of their questions answered, submit applications, submit plans, track the progress of their applications and plans, and interact with key staff throughout the process. Staff from different departments could interact on-line with the plans pulled up on their PCs. Interested parties in the community, Planning Board members, and elected officials could stay in touch with developments of interest. Customers who physically visit the development review departments should be able to access the same information contained on the web page through easy-to-use kiosks. The information needs of customers should for the most part be handled through self-service, whether over the Internet or through the kiosks.

Key benefits of this proposal include:

- Significant efficiencies are created in that a large consumer of staff time in Planning and in other development review departments is providing information. The web site would make most information readily available to anyone.
- Staff time could be reallocated to other functions which would bring greater efficiency to the entire planning process; for example, more time could be spent developing area plans, which in turn saves more time by reducing the number of zoning cases.
- The credibility of the City and County in selling itself as a home for technology based companies is greatly increased. Our community has recently expressed a goal of attracting technology-oriented companies to Winston-Salem. We believe that a Planning Department which is embracing state of the art technologies in the development process would make a more credible impression for our community as a prospective home to such companies. Currently, the process which such companies would encounter is antiquated compared to those of most private sector organizations.
- The ability of department customers to solve their own problems is greatly increased.
- Information on community development plans and proposals is more efficiently made available, increasing the opportunity for appropriate community feedback, and timely resolution of disputes.

The Committee discussed the subject of technology during our various meetings with Mr. Paul Norby, the Director of the Planning Department, and other members of his staff. A summary of those discussions follows. While the Committee agrees with Mr. Norby, we believe that City (and County) government must develop a sense of urgency regarding expanding the use of computer and Internet technologies in all departments involved in the development review process.

To make and keep our community as competitive as possible during this time of change and transition in our economy, it is crucial to have the information resources in the hands of all governmental agencies who deliver and plan for services, as well as the decision-makers who make major public policy decisions. Also, communities that can put extensive and well-organized information in the hands of private sector decision-makers will be better able to attract future investment.

Over the last several years, a GIS (Geographic Information System) has slowly been developed using a patched together collection of dispersed information, systems, and hardware and software between several City and County departments. The Planning Board staff has been the primary user and developer of the more integrated form of this information to date, with most of the base information coming to it from the County system used primarily by the Tax Office for its own purposes. The data is transferred from there to a GIS server at the Planning office, and after a processing procedure by City IS, Planning adds and maintains additional information and makes it available for limited applications in other City departments on the network.

However, if a more integrated and comprehensive approach were taken to the management, development, and use of the system across both the City and County, the system could be of much greater strategic use to both governments and the larger community. Such an approach would involve more departments in both governments in the building of the system with more information, a uniform protocol for updating and maintaining the system, and a cooperative effort in training staff on the use and application of the system. This could result in an explosion

of information sharing and analysis capabilities among departments, and enhance decision-making and operations in both governments. The possibilities are not limited to those departments dealing with just the "built" environment, but have many possible applications in the public protection, social services and educational areas.

There are other possibilities that begin to emerge when such a system is developed as a comprehensive City/County government system. The utility companies may have use for the information (as well as more information to contribute), as may real estate, development and marketing firms. Institutional and research uses and contributions to the data could be involved. In fact, the emerging "Winston-Net" initiative of creating a hard-wired loop in Winston-Salem linking the institutional, research, educational and governmental users would be an ideal opportunity to explore for integration with the GIS. GIS could be linked with more extensive web site development so that information can be transferred to the development community, and in turn, applications and plans could be transmitted electronically back to governmental offices (sort of an electronic "one-stop shop").

Moving in this direction would require some thinking that is "outside the box." Creating joint ownership of the system between the City and County, establishing a shared GIS management staff, collaboratively preparing a plan for comprehensive development of the system, instituting a training and development program together with the hardware and software investment necessary to put the technology to use on people's desks, and looking for linkages with the private sector and institutional/research users are all steps that should be seriously explored. If Winston-Salem is to successfully navigate this transition period, organizing to harness and use this type of technology to our advantage is a significant step toward the future.

ONE STOP SHOPPING

The need for "One Stop Shopping" was brought up to the Committee numerous times by customers. We were pleased from our very first conversation with Mr. Norby that he is also a proponent of this concept. Mr. Norby organized a trip to Charlotte to review their "one stop" structure. It is our understanding that at least a partial "one-stop" scenario is now in the plans for the new City Hall South. A summary of the subcommittee's discussions, which the subcommittee found to be persuasive, with Mr. Norby and the Planning Department staff concerning consolidated services delivery follows.

Some of the more economically competitive cities in the state have created a more convenient and friendly way to serve customers of development review departments. The method they chose was establishment of a centralized, interdepartmental customer service counter or lobby staffed cooperatively by the departments involved in development review. At this single place, people can check on zoning, subdivision, utility, streets and building permit information, drop off plans for review, and have brief discussions about development questions. Citizens or development interests do not have to shuttle between offices in different locations to obtain a variety of information. Staff of the different departments who do development review work physically with each other, increasing interaction and coordination, and over time, are able to assist each other in limited ways. This "one-stop shop" center creates benefits for both customers and staff, and ultimately has the goal of adding a higher level of coordination and quality to the development review process.

Winston-Salem has an opportunity to create such a center with the City Hall South project. The building will house all the major development review offices including City-County Planning, City-County Inspections, City Engineering, and City Transportation. Although all of these departments will obviously not fit on one floor, it would be possible to creatively arrange the staffs of those departments who are directly involved with development review on one floor. A customer service lobby or counter could be created, with sections allocated for each specialty area (i.e. zoning, subdivision/site plan, building permits, streets, utilities, signs, etc).

Staff at the counters would be available for assisting customers and answering quick phone inquiries. A coordinated phone answering and reception component would be included. A self-help area with touch-screen computers could be added. And in close proximity to the service counter area (but out of sight), staff from different departments who actually review the plans could be stationed to do their work, interact with their counterparts from other departments, and have quick access to the counter as needed. Because information (maps, files, etc) from all these departments would be in the same area, staff would eventually be learning how to find information not traditionally in their area of responsibility, and added to their daily interaction with other staff would develop a more versatile knowledge base with which to conduct their work. Since other staff from each department who

are not directly or daily involved in the development review process are located on either the same floor or on the floor directly above or below this floor, staff interaction within each department is still very easy to accomplish.

Because the expenditure for a new building and furnishings is already being made to accommodate this move, setting up this customer service center would have little if any additional cost if it can be planned soon. This is in contrast to other cities that have had to spend considerable sums to create such a center or have not done it at all because of the cost.

All this would benefit the customer, and give our community a friendly and accessible face in dealing positively with our citizens and development clients. That, in turn, positively influences our competitive edge in this changing economic climate.

RECOMMENDATIONS

Success in managing the dynamic relationship between the owners/developers of land and their neighbors and the public good is one of the most important objectives of local government. The resources devoted to the Planning Department are actually critical investments in our future. The time is now to make our City and County the places they will become, and we are fortunate to be able to be in a position to make important positive decisions.

We can make the Planning Department more efficient in accomplishing this goal by finding ways to do necessary jobs faster and better, by improving processes and systems, and by allocating resources to important work.

FINDING

Success in managing the dynamic relationship between the owners/developers of land and their neighbors and the public good is one of the most important objectives of local government. The resources devoted to planning today are critical investments in our future.

RECOMMENDATION

Consolidate departmental services that serve the development community and the public as soon as possible to create "One Stop Shopping."

FINDING

The computer system is inadequate for the needs of the department.

RECOMMENDATION

Use computerization and technology to the fullest extent possible for data entry of development plans, plan review and comment, and status inquiry.

FINDING

The re-zoning process and land use plans are not always fair or predictable.

RECOMMENDATION

Bring increased legitimacy and predictability to the land use system, and especially to the re-zoning process. Continue to try to find ways to reduce the use of "S" zones.

FINDING

Re-zoning requests for manufactured housing is a time consuming area.

RECOMMENDATION

Develop and implement a workable policy on manufactured housing.

FINDING

The Planning Department is performing its duties admirably and only the length of service of many of the staff make it possible to function with the number of staff available.

RECOMMENDATION

Ensure that the department is staffed at levels adequate to handle its assigned responsibilities.

The Subcommittee found that the Planning Office is performing its duties admirably and that only the length of service of many of the staff make it possible to function with the number of staff available. There were no weaknesses noted in the handling of work assignments in accordance with the procedures outlined by ordinance and the Planning Board. We agreed with Mr. Norby in the provision of more time within the document review schedule to comment on plans, to ascertain that they do meet the legal requirements and that the discretionary protections for surrounding properties were being utilized.